

# A review of the ecotoxicological effects of nanowires

J. I. Kwak · Y.-J. An

Received: 23 June 2014 / Revised: 28 October 2014 / Accepted: 22 November 2014 / Published online: 2 December 2014  
© Islamic Azad University (IAU) 2014

**Abstract** We briefly reviewed the existing research on the ecotoxicity of nanowires and suggested directions for further study. Nanowires are technological innovations that can benefit humans. However, it is important to consider the effects of nanowires on the environment. Only a few studies have reported acute and chronic ecological toxicity of nanowires on aquatic and terrestrial organisms, and limited research papers have reported antibacterial effects of nanowires. It is assumed that nanowires have a toxic mechanism similar to that of nanoparticles or ions, but the mechanism remains unknown because so little research has been conducted on the ecological toxicity of nanowires. More in-depth assessments of the chronic toxicity, bioavailability, cytotoxicity, and genotoxicity of nanowires on various species are needed.

**Keywords** Nanowires · Nanowire array · One-dimensional nanomaterials · Ecotoxicity · Toxicity

## Introduction

Nanomaterials are widely used in the electronic, chemical, and medical industries and play a role in the global development of industry. The properties of nanomaterials differ from those of bulk materials and ions. Nanomaterials have various shapes, including nanospheres, nanorods, nanotubes, nanowires, nanodisk, nanofilms, nanofilaments, and nanoplates. They may be zero dimensional (0D), one dimensional (1D), two dimensional (2D), or three

dimensional (3D). Nanospheres, nanoparticles, and quantum dots are defined as 0D nanomaterials. Nanowires, nanorods, nanotubes, nanobelts, and nanoribbons are 1D nanomaterials, whereas nanowire arrays, nanowire fabrics, nanodisks, nanofilms, nanoplates, nanosheets, nanowalls, nanofibers, and nanoprisms are 2D nanomaterials (An et al. 2009; Shingubara et al. 1997; Tiwari et al. 2012; Zhang et al. 2009).

By definition, a nanowire is a wire with a nanoscale diameter. Nanowires have potential applications in the biomedical and clinical industries (Brammer et al. 2009; Johansson et al. 2010; Nataraj et al. 2014; Singh et al. 2013), as antibacterial agents (Fellahi et al. 2013; Holtz et al. 2010, 2012; Wu et al. 2011), as sensors of metals (Luo et al. 2009; Mu et al. 2007), in solar cells (Garnett and Yang 2010; Hamilton et al. 2009), in the removal of metals (Jia et al. 2013; Youssef and Malhat 2014), and in energy storage (Chen et al. 2009; Tiwari et al. 2012).

The number of uses of nanowires continues to increase, and a number of toxicological studies on human or mammalian cells have confirmed the biocompatibility and biosafety of various nanowires. These studies examined silver nanowires (Kim and Shin 2014; Schinwald et al. 2012; Stoehr et al. 2011; Verma et al. 2012), zinc oxide nanowires (Müller et al. 2010; Li et al. 2008), titanium dioxide nanowires (Hamilton et al. 2009; Park et al. 2013), nickel nanowires (Poland et al. 2012), magnetic nanowires (Safi et al. 2011), silica nanowires (Adili et al. 2008; Alexander et al. 2012; Julien et al. 2010; Xie et al. 2014; Zhang et al. 2012), iron nanowires (Song et al. 2010), tellurium nanowires (Song et al. 2011), and cerium nanowire (Ji et al. 2012).

Because nanowires can be released into the environment, ecotoxicological studies of nanowires have also been conducted. In this brief review, reports of the

J. I. Kwak · Y.-J. An (✉)  
Department of Environmental Science, Konkuk University,  
1 Hwayang-dong, Gwangjin-gu, Seoul 143-701, Korea  
e-mail: anyjoo@konkuk.ac.kr



ecotoxicological effects of nanowires and nanowire arrays were collected and intensively reviewed, and the need for future studies to assess the safety of nanowires was examined. To the best of our knowledge, this is the first review of the ecotoxicological effects of nanowires and is highly relevant to ecological risk assessments of nanomaterials by industries and governments.

### Toxicity of nanowires to aquatic and sediment biota

There have been numerous reports of nanoparticles' ecotoxicity on aquatic and sediment biota, but few ecotoxicological studies of nanowires have been conducted (Table 1). The toxicity of nanowires has been evaluated in two fish species (*Danio rerio* and *Oncorhynchus mykiss*), three crustacean species (*Hyalella azteca*, *Daphnia similis*, and *Daphnia magna*), and three sediment-dwelling invertebrates (*Lumbriculus variegatus*, *Lampsilis siliquoidea*, and *Chironomus dilutus*).

Mwangi et al. (2011) assessed the toxicity of silicon carbide nanowires (SiC NWs) to sediment-dwelling invertebrates exposed through water or sediment, using *H. azteca*, *L. variegatus*, *L. siliquoidea*, and *C. dilutus*. When *H. azteca* were exposed to sonicated or nonsonicated SiC NWs in hard water and sediment, no significant mortality was observed due to nonsonicated SiC NWs, but 0 % survival was observed after exposure to the sonicated SiC NWs. Mwangi et al. (2011) assumed that sonication broke the SiC NWs into particles and caused surface hydroxylation that had fatal effects on *H. azteca*. Otherwise, sediment-dwelling worms, mussels, and insects that were exposed only to sonicated SiC NWs were not affected, even by exposure for 96 h at a concentration of 1.0 g/L. This result indicated that sediment-dwelling worms, mussels, and insects showed less sensitivity than amphipod *H. azteca* to the sonicated SiC NWs. Mwangi et al. (2011) also found that layering of SiC NWs on the sediment surface induced more growth inhibition of *H. azteca* than did mixing SiC NWs in the sediment because layered SiC NWs were more available to the *H. azteca* than mixed SiC NWs in the sediment.

In tests of nanowires' effects on fish embryos, silica nanowires (Si NWs) (Nelson et al. 2010) and silver nanowires (Ag NWs) (George et al. 2012) were fatal to zebrafish embryos (*D. rerio*). According to Nelson et al. (2010), Si NWs caused mortality of developing *D. rerio* embryos at an LD50 of 110 pg/g and also induced birth defects (teratogenicity) by interfering with neurulation and disrupting the expression of *sonic hedgehog*. George et al. (2012) investigated the different shapes of Ag nanomaterials (nanospheres, nanowires, and nanoplates), using *D. rerio* embryos and *O. mykiss* gill cells in vitro. In the embryo

test, Ag NWs did not affect hatching rate (48 hpf at 5 µg/mL), but mortality was induced at 120 hpf at 5 µg/mL. In the in vitro test, Ag NWs did not reduce cell viability but did cause potential oxidative stress.

Ag NWs were potentially acutely toxic to *Daphnia*. Artal et al. (2013) studied the role of silver and vanadium release in the toxicity of silver vanadate nanowires (AgVO<sub>3</sub> NWs) to *D. similis*, using AgVO<sub>3</sub> NWs decorated with Ag NPs, and estimated the EC50-48 h at 1 µg/L. Scanlan et al. (2013) investigated the acute toxicity of different-sized and coated Ag NWs on *D. magna* and concluded that short and SiO<sub>2</sub>-coated AgNWs were more toxic to this species than were long or PVP-coated AgNWs. However, no correlation between gene expression and LC50 was apparent.

### Toxicity of nanowires to terrestrial biota

To date, only one article has reported the impacts of nanowires on terrestrial organisms (Table 2). Adolfsson et al. (2013) investigated the effects of bare and hafnium oxide-coated gallium phosphide nanowires (GaP NWs) on the lifespan, fertility, rate of gene mutation, and immune response of the fruit fly, *Drosophila melanogaster*, using a food-exposure approach. There were no changes of gene expression or immune responses when *D. melanogaster* larvae were exposed, until the third instar (88–99 h). In addition, GaP NWs did not significantly affect lifespan or fecundity of adult flies, except for a slight decrease in fertility at day 29, although the test subjects were exposed chronically for 49–58 days. Adolfsson et al. (2013) detected a slight decrease in fecundity when adult flies were exposed to hafnium oxide-coated GaP NWs. In order to determine the acute and chronic ecotoxicity of nanowires to terrestrial organisms, many further studies using various terrestrial species and exposure through soil tests are needed.

### Toxicity of nanowires to bacteria

As shown in Table 3, 18 studies have examined the antibacterial properties of nanowires. The antibacterial effects of Ag-based NWs (Holtz et al. 2010, 2012; Jiang et al. 2012; Liu et al. 2013; Schoen et al. 2010; Singh et al. 2014; Tamboli et al. 2012; Tang et al. 2014; Visnapuu et al. 2013; Zhang et al. 2007), Si NWs (Lv et al. 2010), ZnO NWs (Kılıç and Omay 2014; Wu et al. 2011), MgO NWs (Al-Hazmi et al. 2012), Mn<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub> NWs (Hassan et al. 2012), Ti-based NWs (Nataraj et al. 2014; Shang et al. 2010), and CdO NWs (Kumar and Ojha 2013) were evaluated. Test subjects included the pathogenic bacteria species *Escherichia coli*, *Bacillus subtilis*, *Staphylococcus aureus*,

**Table 1** An overview of nanotoxicological studies regarding the effects of nanowires on aquatic and sediment species

	Ref.	Nanowire (NW)	NW diameter (nm)	NW length (μm)	Test species	Exposure media	Test duration	Observation	Endpoint	Endpoint value
Fish	Nelson et al. (2010)	Si NW	55 (SEM) <sup>a</sup>	2.1	<i>D. rerio</i>	Sterile, nuclease-free water	132 hpf	Si NWs showed mortal and teratogenic effects on developing <i>D. rerio</i> embryos	Mortality, teratogenesis	LD50 = 110 pg/g
	George et al. (2012)	Ag NW	60 (TEM) <sup>b</sup>	50–20	<i>O. mykiss</i>	L-15 medium	24 h	Ag NW did not induce cell death, but induced superoxide production	Cell viability, oxidative stress	–
					<i>D. rerio</i>	Holtfreter's medium	120 hpf	Ag NW did not affect hatching rate (48 hpf at 5 μg/mL), but induced mortality (120 hpf at 5 μg/mL)	Survival, hatching, morphological defects	–
Crustacean	Mwangi et al. (2011)	SiC NW	40–800 (DLS) <sup>c</sup>	5–65	<i>H. azteca</i>	Hard water	24 h	No significant mortality was observed after nonsonicated SiC NW exposure, but 0 % survival was observed after sonicated SiC NW exposure	Survival	–
						Sediment	10 days	Sonicated SiC NW inhibited the amphipods' growth	Survival, growth	–
	Artal et al. (2013)	AgNPs-AgVO <sub>3</sub> NW <sup>d</sup>	–	–	<i>D. similis</i>	OECD M4	48 h	EC50–48 h of silver vanadate nanowires decorated with silver nanoparticles were observed at 1 μg/L	Immobilization	EC50 = 1 μg/L
Mussel	Scanlan et al. (2013)	Ag NW-PVP <sup>e</sup>	65	20	<i>D. magna</i>	COMBO	24 h	Short and SiO <sub>2</sub> -coated Ag NWs were more toxic to daphnia than were long or PVP-coated Ag NWs. LC50 was not correlated with gene expression.	Survival, gene expression, accumulation	LC50 = 234 μg/L
		Ag NW-SiO <sub>2</sub> <sup>f</sup>	65	20						LC50 = 522 μg/L
		Ag NW-PVP <sup>e</sup>	30	2						LC50 = 421 μg/L
Worm		Ag NW-SiO <sub>2</sub> <sup>f</sup>	30	2						LC50 = 155 μg/L
		Ag NW-PVP <sup>e</sup>	65	20		EPA				LC50 = 415 μg/L
		Ag NW-SiO <sub>2</sub> <sup>f</sup>	65	20						LC50 = 227 μg/L
Insect		Ag NW-PVP <sup>e</sup>	30	2						LC50 = 261 μg/L
		Ag NW-SiO <sub>2</sub> <sup>f</sup>	30	2						LC50 = 3.6 μg/L
	Mwangi et al. (2011)	SiC NW	40–800 (DLS) <sup>c</sup>	5–65	<i>L. siliquioidea</i>	Hard water	96 h	Sonicated SiC NW was not toxic to mussels	Survival	–
Worm		SiC NW	40–800 (DLS) <sup>c</sup>	5–65	<i>L. variegatus</i>	Hard water	96 h	Sonicated SiC NW was not toxic to oligochaetes	Survival	–
		SiC NW	40–800 (DLS) <sup>c</sup>	5–65	<i>C. dilutus</i>	Hard water	96 h	Sonicated SiC NW was not toxic to midges	Survival	–

<sup>a</sup> Transmission electron microscope, <sup>b</sup> scanning electron microscope, <sup>c</sup> dynamic light scattering, <sup>d</sup> silver nanoparticle-decorated AgVO<sub>3</sub> NWs, <sup>e</sup> PVP-coated Ag NWs, <sup>f</sup> SiO<sub>2</sub>-coated Ag NWs



**Table 2** An overview of nanotoxicological studies examining the effects of nanowires on terrestrial species

	Ref.	Nanowire (NW)	NW diameter (nm)	NW length (μm)	Test species	Exposure media	Test duration	Observation	Endpoint	Endpoint value
Insect	Adolfsson et al. (2013)	GaP NW <sup>a</sup>	80 (particle analyzer)	4	Fruit fly ( <i>Drosophila melanogaster</i> )	Food exposure (yeast)	49 days 88–96 h	No adverse effects of GaP NWs were observed	Life span, fertility, gene mutation, immune response	–

*Enterococcus faecalis*, *Salmonella enterica*, *Candida albicans*, and *Aspergillus niger*. All studies shown in Table 3 assessed growth inhibition, and some studies also calculated the maximal inhibitory concentration (MIC) and minimal bactericidal concentration (MBC) of tested nanowires by performing MIC and MBC tests. Although test methods, tested nanowires, exposure concentration, exposure duration, medium, and tested bacteria strains varied, the research studies demonstrated the potential antibacterial properties of each nanowire. However, it is not well confirmed that nanowires have adverse effects on environmentally important and beneficial microbial communities when nanowires are released into the environment.

### Antibacterial properties of nanowire arrays and fabrics

A range of types of nanowires have applications as nanowire arrays and fabrics. Table 4 presents the literature evaluating the ecotoxicity of nanowire arrays or fabrics. These studies investigated the antibacterial properties of nanowire arrays or fabrics to eliminate pathogenic bacteria species in antibacterial applications. Unfortunately, the ecotoxicological effects of nanowire arrays and fabrics on aquatic and terrestrial organisms have not been studied.

Three studies tested the effects of Si NW arrays, and one study tested the effects of ZnO NW arrays on organisms. Wang et al. (2007) reported that well-defined, less-oriented or randomly oriented ZnO NW arrays reduce the survival of *E. coli* after a 90-min exposure. Wang et al. (2011) confirmed that Si NW arrays modified with quaternized poly (2-(dimethylamino ethyl) methacrylate) (pDMA-EMA) led to high bacterial adhesion and cell death of *E. coli* after an 18-h exposure. Fellahi et al. (2013) reported that Si NW arrays decorated with AgNPs or CuNPs showed antibacterial activity after a 24-h exposure and induced leakage of sugars and proteins from the cell membranes of bacteria, reducing cell viability. Li et al. (2014) observed antibacterial effects of Si NW arrays on *E. coli*, *B. subtilis*, and *S. aureus*.

Davoudi et al. (2014) synthesized silver-7,7,8,8-tetracyanoquinodimethane nanowire fabrics and confirmed that they have potential antimicrobial applications by observing antibacterial effects on *E. coli* and *Staphylococcus albus*.

### Toxic mechanism of nanowires

Demonstrations of the toxicity level and the relative contributions of dissolved ions and nanomaterials are important in order to understand the toxic mechanisms in nanotoxicology. However, studies have reported different results for the relative contribution to toxicity of dissolved ions from nanowires and from nanomaterials themselves. Davoudi et al. (2014) observed that Ag NW fabrics possessed antibacterial properties. Visnapuu et al. (2013) reported that dissolved Ag ions from Ag NWs caused toxic effects on microorganisms, after conducting an analysis with AAS. Jiang et al. (2012) reported that released Ag ions from Ag-doped trimolybdate nanowires caused toxic effects and produced reactive oxygen species (ROS) in bacteria.

In the studies reporting bactericidal properties of nanowires, the way in which nanowires reduced cell viability was confirmed. Nataraj et al. (2014) observed that TiO<sub>2</sub> NWs disrupted the membrane potential of *S. aureus*. Fellahi et al. (2013) confirmed that Si NWs induced the leakage of sugars and proteins from the cell membrane. Al-Hazmi et al. (2012) reported that MgO NWs broke bacterial cell membranes and damaged *E. coli* cells. Mn<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub> NWs were also observed to disrupt *E. coli* cell membranes and to cause leakage of intracellular contents in a study that used TEM analysis (Hassan et al. 2012). According to Zhang et al. (2007), the effects of Ag NWs on bacteria may be similar to those of Ag, which has strong antibacterial activity and inactivates bacterial proteins by interacting with the -SH group in the bacterial protein molecules. Likewise, Wang et al. (2007) speculated that the toxic mechanism of ZnO NW arrays affecting bacteria was similar to the toxic mechanism of ZnO NPs, which are broadly known to generate ROS.



**Table 3** An overview of studies with nanowires on antibacterial properties

Ref.	Nanowire (NW)	NW diameter (nm)	NW length	Test species	Exposure media	Test duration (h)	Observation	Endpoint	Endpoint value
Zhang et al. (2007)	Ag NW composite	–	–	<i>Escherichia coli</i>	–	–	Ag NW/mesoporous silica composites showed highly inhibitory effects on bacteria	Growth inhibition	MIC = 90–300 ppm
Holtz et al. (2010)	AgNPs–AgVO <sub>3</sub> NW	60 (TEM) <sup>a</sup>	Micron	<i>Staphylococcus aureus</i> (3 strains)	Mueller–Hinton broth	18	MIC <sup>a</sup> of AgVO <sub>3</sub> NW decorated with AgNPs was 6.75–12.5 µg/mL or 3.4–6.75 µg/mL	Growth inhibition	MIC = 6.75–12.5 or 3.4–6.75 µg/mL
Schoen et al. (2010)	Ag	40–100 (SEM) <sup>b</sup>	10 µm	<i>Escherichia coli</i>	Agar plate	Overnight	Bacteria were not observed in the Ag NW-treated filters	Growth inhibition	–
Shang et al. (2010)	AgNPs–titanate NW	80–100 (SEM) <sup>b</sup>	>100 µm	<i>Escherichia coli</i>	MacConkey sorbitol agar	18–24	Bactericidal activities of AgNPs on titanate nanowire and titanate nanowire were reduced	Growth inhibition	–
Lv et al. (2010)	AgNPs–Si NW	–	–	<i>Escherichia coli</i> <i>Bacillus subtilis</i>	LB agar plate (Modified Kirby–Bauer technique)	24	SiNW decorated with AgNPs demonstrated long-term antibacterial activity	Growth inhibition	–
				<i>Escherichia coli</i> <i>Bacillus subtilis</i>	LB media (Bacterial kinetic test)	48		Bacterial kinetic	–
				<i>Escherichia coli</i> <i>Bacillus subtilis</i>	LB broth (MIC test)	36		Growth inhibition	–
				<i>Escherichia coli</i>	Sterile saline solution (airborne bacteria test)	Overnight		Growth inhibition	–
Wu et al. (2011)	Pure ZnO NW 0.6 mol% Na–ZnO NW 1.2 mol% Na–ZnO NW	~40 (TEM) <sup>a</sup>	–	<i>Escherichia coli</i>	Lactose broth agar	24	Pure or Na-doped ZnO NWs exhibited the antibacterial activity	Growth inhibition	MIC = 30 µg/mL MIC = 10 µg/mL MIC = 1 µg/mL
Al-Hazmi et al. (2012)	MgO NW	6 (SEM) <sup>b</sup>	10 µm	<i>Escherichia coli</i> <i>Bacillus subtilis</i> <i>Escherichia coli</i> <i>Bacillus subtilis</i>	Nutrient agar media Nutrient broth media	24 24	Increasing antibacterial activity was observed with increasing MgO NW concentration	Growth inhibition	–
Hassan et al. (2012)	Mn <sub>2</sub> O <sub>3</sub> NW	70–80 (SEM) <sup>b</sup>	–	<i>Escherichia coli</i>	TSV broth Nutrient agar plate	24 72	Mn <sub>2</sub> O <sub>3</sub> NW induced cytotoxicity and showed bactericidal potential	Growth inhibition Cell viability, morphological alterations, cell damage	–



Table 3 continued

Ref.	Nanowire (NW)	NW diameter (nm)	NW length	Test species	Exposure media	Test duration (h)	Observation	Endpoint	Endpoint value
Holtz et al. (2012)	AgNPs–AgVO <sub>3</sub> NW	20–60 (TEM) <sup>a</sup>	Micron	<i>Enterococcus faecalis</i> (two strains) <i>Escherichia coli</i>	Mueller–Hinton medium	48	MIC of AgVO <sub>3</sub> NWs decorated with AgNPs was lower than that of oxacillin (a commonly used antibiotic). MBC <sup>b</sup> of AgVO <sub>3</sub> NW demonstrated antibacterial activity	Growth inhibition	MIC = 5.00 µg/mL, MBC > 69 µg/mL
				<i>Staphylococcus aureus</i> (three strains) <i>Salmonella enterica</i>					MIC = 1.00 µg/mL, MBC = 1.00 µg/mL
									MIC = 3.15 µg/mL, MBC = 3.15 or 6.25 µg/mL
									MIC = 3.15 µg/mL, MBC = 3.15 µg/mL
Jiang et al. (2012)	Ag-trimolybdate nanowire	10–100 (SEM) <sup>b</sup>	~100 µm	<i>Escherichia coli</i> <i>Staphylococcus aureus</i> <i>Candida albicans</i> <i>Aspergillus niger</i>	Martin medium	10	Ag-doped trimolybdate nanowire affected bacterial activity	Growth inhibition	–
Tamboli et al. (2012)	Ag–PANI	50–70 (SEM) <sup>b</sup>	–	<i>Bacillus subtilis</i>	Mueller–Hinton medium	24	MIC and MBC values of Ag-polyaniline nanocomposites were same as 25 µg/mL	Growth inhibition	MIC = 25 µg/mL, MBC = 25 µg/mL
Kumar and Ojha (2013)	CdO NW	~15 (TEM) <sup>a</sup>	~1 µm	<i>Escherichia coli</i> <i>Bacillus subtilis</i>	Mueller–Hinton agar medium	Overnight	CdO NWs showed antimicrobial activity. <i>B. subtilis</i> were more affected than <i>E. coli</i>	Growth inhibition	–
Liu et al. (2013)	Ag NW	47 (SEM) <sup>b</sup>	–	<i>Escherichia coli</i> <i>Bacillus subtilis</i> <i>Staphylococcus aureus</i>	Nutrient agar medium	24	AgNWs showed antimicrobial activity. <i>B. subtilis</i> were more affected than <i>S. aureus</i> or <i>E. coli</i>	Growth inhibition	–
Visnapuu et al. (2013)	Ag NW	100	6.1 µm	<i>Escherichia coli</i>	LB broth	4	Dissolved Ag from Ag NWs was toxic to bacteria	Bioluminescent	EC50 = 0.42 mg/L
Kiliç and Omay (2014)	ZnO NW	60 (TEM) <sup>a</sup>	10 µm	<i>Staphylococcus aureus</i>	LB agar media	18	ZnO NW-coated film showed antibacterial activity	Growth inhibition	–
Nataraj et al. (2014)	TiO <sub>2</sub> NW	50–150 (SEM) <sup>b</sup>	–	<i>Staphylococcus aureus</i>	LB broth	96	TiO <sub>2</sub> NWs affected bacterial growth and membrane potential more than did TiO <sub>2</sub> nanoparticles	Growth inhibition, change in membrane potential	–





**Table 3** continued

Ref.	Nanowire (NW)	NW diameter (nm)	NW length	Test species	Exposure media	Test duration (h)	Observation	Endpoint	Endpoint value
Singh et al. (2014)	Ag/AgVO <sub>3</sub> NW	~80 (TEM) <sup>a</sup>	~3 µm (SEM)	<i>Escherichia coli</i>	Mueller-Hilton broth	18	The MIC values of Ag/AgVO <sub>3</sub> NWs were lower than ciprofloxacin (reference antibiotic agent)	Growth inhibition	MIC = 1 µg/mL
				<i>Bacillus subtilis</i>		48			MIC = 5 µg/mL
				<i>Escherichia coli</i>					MBC = 0.5 µg/mL
				<i>Bacillus subtilis</i>					MBC = 5 µg/mL
Tang et al. (2014)	Ag NW	60–140 (SEM) <sup>b</sup>	–	<i>Escherichia coli</i>	Nutrient agar	24	Ag NWs had bactericidal efficiency	Growth inhibition	–
				<i>Staphylococcus aureus</i>					–

MIC minimum inhibitory concentration, MBC minimal bactericidal concentration

<sup>a</sup> Transmission electron microscope, <sup>b</sup> scanning electron microscope

However, there is limited information regarding the toxic mechanism of nanowires in aquatic and terrestrial organisms. Ag NWs generated superoxide in *O. mykiss* gill cells and affected the survival rates of *D. rerio* embryos (George et al. 2012). Si NWs also killed developing *D. rerio* and induced teratogenicity by interfering with neurulation and disrupting the expression of *sonic hedgehog* (Nelson et al. 2010). Because limited ecological toxicity tests have been conducted, the toxic mechanisms of nanowires are still under investigation and require further research.

## Conclusion

It is important to understand whether nanomaterials, including nanowires, pose a risk to the environment, but so far, there are limited studies of this area. Only 24 ecotoxicological studies of nanowires have been reported since 2007, and most of them were conducted since 2010. Many more studies of ecotoxicology have been conducted on nanoparticles than on nanowires. The most studied nanowire was Ag NW (15 citations), followed by Si NW (2 citations), ZnO NW (2 citations), TiO<sub>2</sub> NW (1 citation), MgO NW (1 citation), Mn<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub> NW (1 citation), CdO NW (1 citation), and GaP NW (1 citation). A number of studies have focused on the antibacterial capabilities of nanowires to evaluate their potential applicability in medicine; however, the impacts of nanowires on environmentally important microbial communities and ecosystems are poorly understood. Additionally, few studies confirmed modes of toxicity of nanowires or contribution of ion toxicity dissolved from nanowires.

The following types of studies are needed in order to assess the ecological effects of nanowires:

- Ecological toxicity data regarding aquatic and terrestrial organisms. The existing literature is insufficient and consists mainly of studies of microbial organisms. Reliable endpoint values (LCx, ECx, LOEC, NOEC) are also needed.
- Genotoxicity and cytotoxicity of nanowires. The mechanism of toxicity to organisms, particularly terrestrial ones, is not clear. Understanding genotoxic effects and cellular effects can provide clues to the mechanism.
- Bioavailability of nanowires to organisms (e.g., bioaccumulation studies, depuration studies). It is important to assess the fate of nanowires in the environment.
- Chronic effects of nanowires. Very limited results were reported for this topic.

Although we are challenging to confirm the risk of nanomaterials including nanowires, there are limited



**Table 4** Studies of the antibacterial properties of nanowire arrays and fabrics

Ref.	Nanowire arrays	NW diameter (nm)	NW length (μm)	Test species	Exposure media	Test duration	Observation	Endpoint	Endpoint value
Wang et al. (2007)	ZnO NW array	150 (SEM) <sup>a</sup>	–	<i>Escherichia coli</i> <i>Staphylococcus aureus</i>	LB media –	90 min 90 min	Antibacterial properties of ZnO nanowires were observed	Survival	– –
Wang et al. (2011)	Si NW array	~100 (SEM) <sup>a</sup>	~25	<i>Escherichia coli</i>	PBS (Bacterial adhesion) LB agar plate (Antibacterial activity)	10 min 18 h	Si NW array modified with quarternized pDMAEMA <sup>b</sup> inhibited bacterial activity	Bacteria adhesion Growth inhibition	– –
Fellahi et al. (2013)	Si NW array AgNP-Si NW array <sup>c</sup> CuNP-Si NW array <sup>d</sup>	20–100 (SEM) <sup>a</sup> – –	5	<i>Escherichia coli</i>	LB media (viability) Nutrient agar medium	18 h 24 h	Si NW arrays decorated with AgNPs or CuNPs showed antibacterial activity and induced leakage of sugars and proteins from the cell membranes of bacteria	Viability Growth inhibition, growth kinetics, membrane leakage	– – –
Davoudi et al. (2014)	Ag/AgTCNQ NW fabrics <sup>e</sup>	50–300 (SEM) <sup>a</sup>	100	<i>Escherichia coli</i> <i>Staphylococcus albus</i>	Nutrient broth	10–60 min	AgTCNQ NWs fabrics showed antibacterial activity against bacteria	Cell viability	– –
Li et al. (2014)	Si NW array	100–250 (SEM) <sup>a</sup>	8	<i>Escherichia coli</i> <i>Bacillus subtilis</i> <i>Staphylococcus aureus</i>	PBS	60 min	Functionalized three-dimensional NW substrate eliminated bacterial activity	Cell viability, growth, morphology	– – –

<sup>a</sup> Scanning electron microscope, <sup>b</sup> poly (2-(dimethylamino ethyl) methacrylate), <sup>c</sup> silver nanoparticle-coated silica nanowire array, <sup>d</sup> copper nanoparticle-coated silica nanowire array, <sup>e</sup> silver-7,7,8,8-tetracyanoquinodimethane nanowire fabrics





ecotoxicological results to protect the ecosystem. We suggest further ecotoxicological testing of nanowires be conducted in order to protect the environment before nanowires are widely commercialized.

**Acknowledgments** This work was supported by the National Research Foundation Grant funded by the Korean Government (NRF 201361386). This study was also supported as a cooperation project for the 2014 Environmental Risk Assessment of Manufactured Nanomaterials funded by the Korea Institute of Toxicology (KIT, Korea).

## References

- Adili A, Crowe S, Beaux MF, Cantrell T, Shapiro PJ, McIlroy DN, Gustin KE (2008) Differential cytotoxicity exhibited by silica nanowires and nanoparticles. *Nanotoxicology* 2:1–8. doi:[10.1080/17435390701843769](https://doi.org/10.1080/17435390701843769)
- Adolfsson K, Schneider M, Hammarin G, Häcker U, Prinz CN (2013) Ingestion of gallium phosphide nanowires has no adverse effect on *Drosophila* tissue function. *Nanotechnology* 24:285101
- Alexander FA Jr, Huey EG, Price DT, Bhansali S (2012) Real-time impedance analysis of silica nanowire toxicity on epithelial breast cancer cells. *Analyst* 137:5823–5828. doi:[10.1039/c2an36341k](https://doi.org/10.1039/c2an36341k)
- Al-Hazmi F, Alnowaiser F, Al-Ghamdi AA, Al-Ghamdi AA, Aly MM, Al-Tuwirqi RM, El-Tantawy F (2012) A new large—scale synthesis of magnesium oxide nanowires: structural and antibacterial properties. *Superlattices Microstruct* 52:200–209
- An B-K, Gihm SH, Chung JW, Park CR, Kwon S-K, Park SY (2009) Color-tuned highly fluorescent organic nanowires/nanofabrics: easy massive fabrication and molecular structural origin. *J Am Chem Soc* 131:3950–3957
- Artal MC, Holtz RD, Kummrow F, Alves OL, Umbuzeiro GDA (2013) The role of silver and vanadium release in the toxicity of silver vanadate nanowires toward *Daphnia similis*. *Environ Toxicol Chem* 32(908–91):2. doi:[10.1002/etc.2128](https://doi.org/10.1002/etc.2128)
- Brammer KS, Choi C, Oh S, Cobb CJ, Connelly LS, Loya M, Kong SD, Jin S (2009) Antibiofouling, sustained antibiotic release by Si nanowire templates. *Nano Lett* 9:3570–3574. doi:[10.1021/nl901769m](https://doi.org/10.1021/nl901769m)
- Chen Z, Qin Y, Weng D, Cio Q, Peng Y, Wang X, Li H, Wei F, Lu Y (2009) Design and synthesis of hierarchical nanowire composites for electrochemical energy storage. *Adv Funct Mater* 19:3420–3426. doi:[10.1002/adfm.200900971](https://doi.org/10.1002/adfm.200900971)
- Davoudi ZM, Kandjani AE, Bhatt AI, Kyratzis IL, O'Mullane AP, Bansal V (2014) Hybrid antibacterial fabrics with extremely high aspect ratio Ag/AgTCNQ nanowires. *Adv Funct Mater* 24:1047–1053. doi:[10.1002/adfm.201302368](https://doi.org/10.1002/adfm.201302368)
- Fellahi O, Sarma RK, Das MR, Saikia R, Marcon L, Coffinier Y, Hadjersi T, Maamache M, Boukherroub R (2013) The antimicrobial effect of silicon nanowires decorated with silver and copper nanoparticles. *Nanotechnology* 24:495101
- Garnett E, Yang P (2010) Light trapping in silicon nanowire solar cells. *Nano Lett* 10:1082–1087. doi:[10.1021/nl100161z](https://doi.org/10.1021/nl100161z)
- George S, Lin S, Ji Z, Thomas CR, Li L, Mecklenburg M, Meng H, Wang X, Zhang H, Xia T, Hohman JN, Lin S, Zink JI, Weiss PS, Nel AE (2012) Surface defects on plate-shaped silver nanoparticles contribute to its hazard potential in a fish gill cell line and zebrafish embryos. *ACS Nano* 6:3745–3759. doi:[10.1021/nl204671v](https://doi.org/10.1021/nl204671v)
- Hamilton R, Wu N, Porter D, Buford M, Wolfarth M, Holian A (2009) Particle length-dependent titanium dioxide nanomaterials toxicity and bioactivity. *Part Fibre Toxicol* 6:35
- Hassan MS, Amna T, Pandeya D, Hamza AM, Bing Y, Kim H-C, Khil M-S (2012) Controlled synthesis of Mn<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub> nanowires by hydrothermal method and their bactericidal and cytotoxic impact: a promising future material. *Appl Microbiol Biotechnol* 95:213–222. doi:[10.1007/s00253-012-3878-6](https://doi.org/10.1007/s00253-012-3878-6)
- Holtz RD, Filho AGS, Brocchi M, Martins D, Durán N, Alves OL (2010) Development of nanostructured silver vanadates decorated with silver nanoparticles as a novel antibacterial agent. *Nanotechnology* 21:185102
- Holtz RD, Lima BA, Souza Filho AG, Brocchi M, Alves OL (2012) Nanostructured silver vanadate as a promising antibacterial additive to water-based paints. *Nanomed Nanotechnol Biol Med* 8:935–940. doi:[10.1016/j.nano.2011.11.012](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.nano.2011.11.012)
- Ji Z, Wang X, Zhang H, Lin S, Meng H, Sun B, George S, Xia T, Nel AE, Zink JI (2012) Designed synthesis of CeO<sub>2</sub> nanorods and nanowires for studying toxicological effects of high aspect ratio nanomaterials. *ACS Nano* 6:5366–5380. doi:[10.1021/nn3012114](https://doi.org/10.1021/nn3012114)
- Jia Y, Luo T, Yu X-Y, Sun B, Liu J-H, Huang X-J (2013) A facile template free solution approach for the synthesis of dypingite nanowires and subsequent decomposition to nanoporous MgO nanowires with excellent arsenate adsorption properties. *RSC Adv* 3:5430–5437. doi:[10.1039/C3RA23340E](https://doi.org/10.1039/C3RA23340E)
- Jiang Y, Gang J, Xu S-Y (2012) Contact mechanism of the Ag-doped trimolybdate nanowire as an antimicrobial agent. *Nano-Micro Lett* 4:228–234. doi:[10.3786/nml.v4i4.p228-234](https://doi.org/10.3786/nml.v4i4.p228-234)
- Johansson F, Jonsson M, Alm K, Kanje M (2010) Cell guidance by magnetic nanowires. *Exp Cell Res* 316:688–694. doi:[10.1016/j.yexcr.2009.12.016](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.yexcr.2009.12.016)
- Julien DC, Richardson CC, Beaux MF 2nd, McIlroy DN, Hill RA (2010) In vitro proliferating cell models to study cytotoxicity of silica nanowires. *Nanomedicine* 6:84–92. doi:[10.1016/j.nano.2009.03.003](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.nano.2009.03.003)
- Kılıç B, Omay D (2014) In-situ deposition of zinc oxide nanowires onto UV-cured chitin derivatives and their antibacterial properties. *Mater Sci Semicond Process* 20:35–40. doi:[10.1016/j.msssp.2013.12.012](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.msssp.2013.12.012)
- Kim MJ, Shin S (2014) Toxic effects of silver nanoparticles and nanowires on erythrocyte rheology. *Food Chem Toxicol* 67:80–86. doi:[10.1016/j.fct.2014.02.006](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fct.2014.02.006)
- Kumar S, Ojha AK (2013) Synthesis, characterizations and antimicrobial activities of well dispersed ultra-long CdO nanowires. *AIP Adv* 3:052109. doi:[10.1063/1.4804930](https://doi.org/10.1063/1.4804930)
- Li Z, Yang R, Yu M, Bai F, Li C, Wang ZL (2008) Cellular level biocompatibility and biosafety of ZnO nanowires. *J Phys Chem C* 112:20114–20117. doi:[10.1021/jp808878p](https://doi.org/10.1021/jp808878p)
- Li Y-Q, Zhu B, Li Y, Leow WR, Goh R, Ma B, Fong E, Tang M, Chen X (2014) A synergistic capture strategy for enhanced detection and elimination of bacteria. *Angew Chem Int Ed* 53:1–6. doi:[10.1002/ange.201310135](https://doi.org/10.1002/ange.201310135)
- Liu L, He C, Li J, Guo J, Yang D, Wei J (2013) Green synthesis of silver nanowires via ultraviolet irradiation catalyzed by phosphomolybdic acid and their antibacterial properties. *New J Chem* 37:2179–2185. doi:[10.1039/C3NJ00135K](https://doi.org/10.1039/C3NJ00135K)
- Luo L, Jie J, Zhang W, He Z, Wang J, Yuan G, Zhang W, Wu LCM, Lee S-T (2009) Silicon nanowire sensors for Hg<sup>2+</sup> and Cd<sup>2+</sup> ions. *Appl Phys Lett* 94:193101–193101–193101–193103. doi:[10.1063/1.3120281](https://doi.org/10.1063/1.3120281)
- Lv M, Su S, He Y, Huang Q, Hu W, Li D, Fan C, Lee S-T (2010) Long-term antimicrobial effect of silicon nanowires decorated with silver nanoparticles. *Adv Mater* 22:5463–5467. doi:[10.1002/adma.201001934](https://doi.org/10.1002/adma.201001934)
- Mu Shi, Chang JC, Lee S-T (2007) Silicon nanowires-based fluorescence sensor for Cu(II). *Nano Lett* 8:104–109. doi:[10.1021/nl072164k](https://doi.org/10.1021/nl072164k)
- Müller KH, Lulkarni J, Motskin M, Goode A, Winship P, Skepper JN, Ryan MP, Porter AE (2010) pH-dependent toxicity of high



- aspect ratio ZnO nanowires in macrophages due to intracellular dissolution. *ACS Nano* 4:6767–6779. doi:[10.1021/nn101192z](https://doi.org/10.1021/nn101192z)
- Mwangi JN, Wang N, Ritts A, Kunz JL, Ingersoll CG, Li H, Deng B (2011) Toxicity of silicon carbide nanowires to sediment-dwelling invertebrates in water or sediment exposures. *Environ Toxicol Chem* 30:981–987. doi:[10.1002/etc.467](https://doi.org/10.1002/etc.467)
- Nataraj N, Anjusree GS, Madhavan AA, Priyanka P, Sankar D, Nisha N, Lakshmi SV, Jayakumar R, Balakrishnan A, Biswas R (2014) Synthesis and anti-staphylococcal activity of TiO<sub>2</sub> nanoparticles and nanowires in ex vivo porcine skin model. *J Biomed Nanotechnol* 10:864–870. doi:[10.1166/jbn.2014.1756](https://doi.org/10.1166/jbn.2014.1756)
- Nelson SM, Mahmoud T, Beaux Ii M, Shapiro P, McIlroy DN, Stenkamp DL (2010) Toxic and teratogenic silica nanowires in developing vertebrate embryos. *Nanomed Nanotechnol Biol Med* 6:93–102. doi:[10.1016/j.nano.2009.05.003](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.nano.2009.05.003)
- Park E-J, Shim H-W, Lee G-H, Kim J-H, Kim D-W (2013) Comparison of toxicity between the different-type TiO<sub>2</sub> nanowires in vivo and in vitro. *Arch Toxicol* 87:1219–1230. doi:[10.1007/s00204-013-1019-3](https://doi.org/10.1007/s00204-013-1019-3)
- Poland CA, Byrne F, Cho W-S, Prina-Mello A, Murphy FA, Davies GL, Coey JMD, Gounko Y, Duffin R, Volkov Y, Donaldson K (2012) Length-dependent pathogenic effects of nickel nanowires in the lungs and the peritoneal cavity. *Nanotoxicology* 6:899–911. doi:[10.3109/17435390.2011.626535](https://doi.org/10.3109/17435390.2011.626535)
- Safi M, Yan M, Guedeau-Boudeville M-A, Conjeaud H, Garnier-Thibaud V, Boggetto N, Baeza-Squiban A, Niedergang F, Averbek D, Berret J-F (2011) Interactions between magnetic nanowires and living cells: uptake, toxicity, and degradation. *ACS Nano* 5:5354–5364. doi:[10.1021/nn201121e](https://doi.org/10.1021/nn201121e)
- Scanlan LD, Reed RB, Loguinov AV, Antczak P, Tagmount A, Aloni S, Nowinski DT, Luong P, Tran C, Karunaratne N, Pham D, Lin XX, Falciani F, Higgins CP, Ranville JF, Vulpe CD, Gilert B (2013) Silver nanowire exposure results in internalization and toxicity to *Daphnia magna*. *ACS Nano* 7:10681–10694. doi:[10.1021/nn4034103](https://doi.org/10.1021/nn4034103)
- Schinwald A, Chernova T, Donaldson K (2012) Use of silver nanowires to determine thresholds for fibre length-dependent pulmonary inflammation and inhibition of macrophage migration in vitro. *Part Fibre Toxicol* 9:34
- Schoen DT, Schoen AP, Hu L, Kim HS, Heilshorn SC, Cui Y (2010) High speed water sterilization using one-dimensional nanostructures. *Nano Lett* 10:3628–3632. doi:[10.1021/nl101944e](https://doi.org/10.1021/nl101944e)
- Shang L, Li B, Dong W, Chen B, Li C, Tang W, Wang G, Wu J, Ying Y (2010) Heteronanostructure of Ag particle on titanate nanowire membrane with enhanced photocatalytic properties and bactericidal activities. *J Hazard Mater* 178:1109–1114. doi:[10.1016/j.jhazmat.2010.01.093](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jhazmat.2010.01.093)
- Shingubara S, Okino O, Sayama Y, Sakaue H, Takahagi T (1997) Ordered two-dimensional nanowire array formation using self-organized nanoholes of anodically oxidized aluminum. *Jpn J Appl Phys* 36:7791–7795
- Singh M, Movia D, Mahfoud OK, Volkov Y, Prina-Mello A (2013) Silver nanowires as prospective carriers for drug delivery in cancer treatment: an in vitro biocompatibility study on lung adenocarcinoma cells and fibroblasts. *Eur J Nanomed* 5(4):195–204
- Singh A, Dutta DP, Ballal A, Tyagi AK, Fulekar MH (2014) Visible light driven photocatalysis and antibacterial activity of AgVO<sub>3</sub> and Ag/AgVO<sub>3</sub> nanowires. *Mater Res Bull* 51:447–454. doi:[10.1016/j.materresbull.2014.01.001](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.materresbull.2014.01.001)
- Song MM, Song WJ, Bi H, Wang J, Wu WL, Sun J, Yu M (2010) Cytotoxicity and cellular uptake of iron nanowires. *Biomaterials* 31:1509–1517. doi:[10.1016/j.biomaterials.2009.11.034](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biomaterials.2009.11.034)
- Song MM, Song WJ, Bi H, Wang J, Wu WL, Sun J, Yu M (2011) Cytotoxic potentials of tellurium nanowires in BALB/3T3 fibroblast cells. *Bull Korean Chem Soc* 32(9):3405–3410. doi:[10.5012/bkcs.2011.32.9.3405](https://doi.org/10.5012/bkcs.2011.32.9.3405)
- Stoehr L, Gonzalez E, Stampfl A, Casals E, Duschl A, Puentes V, Oostingh G (2011) Shape matters: effects of silver nanospheres and wires on human alveolar epithelial cells. *Part Fibre Toxicol* 8:36
- Tamboli MS, Kulkarni MV, Patil RH, Gade WN, Navale SC, Kale BB (2012) Nanowires of silver-polyaniline nanocomposite synthesized via in situ polymerization and its novel functionality as an antibacterial agent. *Colloids Surf B* 92:35–41. doi:[10.1016/j.colsurfb.2011.11.006](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.colsurfb.2011.11.006)
- Tang C, Sun W, Lu J, Yan W (2014) Role of the anions in the hydrothermally formed silver nanowires and their antibacterial property. *J Colloid Interface Sci* 416:86–94. doi:[10.1016/j.jcis.2013.10.036](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jcis.2013.10.036)
- Tiwari JN, Tiwari RN, Kim KS (2012) Zero-dimensional, one-dimensional, two-dimensional and three-dimensional nanostructured materials for advanced electrochemical energy devices. *Prog Mater Sci* 57:724–803. doi:[10.1016/j.pmatsci.2011.08.003](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pmatsci.2011.08.003)
- Verma NK, Conroy J, Loyons PE, Coleman J, O'Sullivan MP, Kornfeld H, Kelleher D, Volkov Y (2012) Autophagy induction by silver nanowires: a new aspect in the biocompatibility assessment of nanocomposite thin films. *Toxicol Appl Pharmacol* 264:451–461. doi:[10.1016/j.taap.2012.08.023](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.taap.2012.08.023)
- Visnapuu M, Joost U, Juganson K, Künnis-Beres K, Kahru A, Kisand V, Ivask A (2013) Dissolution of silver nanowires and nanospheres dictates their toxicity to *Escherichia coli*. *BioMed Res Intern* 2013:1–9. doi:[10.1155/2013/819252](https://doi.org/10.1155/2013/819252)
- Wang X, Yang F, Yang W, Yang X (2007) A study on the antibacterial activity of one-dimensional ZnO nanowire arrays: effects of the orientation and plane surface. *Chem Commun* 14(42):4419–4421. doi:[10.1039/B708662H](https://doi.org/10.1039/B708662H)
- Wang H, Wang L, Zhang P, Yuan L, Yu Q, Chen H (2011) High antibacterial efficiency of pDMAEMA modified silicon nanowire arrays. *Colloids Surf B* 83:355–359. doi:[10.1016/j.colsurfb.2010.12.009](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.colsurfb.2010.12.009)
- Wu C, Shen L, Huang Q, Zhang Y-C (2011) Synthesis of Na-doped ZnO nanowires and their antibacterial properties. *Powder Technol* 205:137–142. doi:[10.1016/j.powtec.2010.09.003](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.powtec.2010.09.003)
- Xie W, Xie Q, Jin M, Huang X, Zhang X, Shao Z, Wen G (2014) The  $\beta$ -SiC nanowires induce apoptosis via oxidative stress in mouse osteoblastic cell line MC3T3-E1 *BioMed Res Intern* 2014:1–9
- Youssef AM, Malhat FM (2014) Selective removal of heavy metals from drinking water using titanium dioxide nanowire. *Macromol Symp* 337:96–101. doi:[10.1002/masy.201450311](https://doi.org/10.1002/masy.201450311)
- Zhang D, Wan Y, Li G, Zhang J, Li H (2007) Synthesis of silver nanowire/mesoporous silica composite as a highly active anti-septic. In: Zhao D, Qiu S, Tng Y, Yu C (eds) *Studies in surface science and catalysis*, vol 165. Elsevier, Amsterdam, pp 841–846. doi:[10.1016/S0167-2991\(07\)80450-2](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0167-2991(07)80450-2)
- Zhang Q, Tan Y, Xie J, Lee J (2009) Colloidal synthesis of plasmonic metallic nanoparticles. *Plasmonics* 4:9–22. doi:[10.1007/s11468-008-9067-x](https://doi.org/10.1007/s11468-008-9067-x)
- Zhang W, Tong L, Yang C (2012) Cellular binding and internalization of functionalized silicon nanowires. *Nano Lett* 12:1002–1006. doi:[10.1021/nl204131n](https://doi.org/10.1021/nl204131n)

